

**U.S. Department of Agriculture  
Food and Nutrition Service  
Administrative Review Branch**

**Parker's Cate,**

**Appellant,**

**v.**

**Office of Retailer Operations  
and Compliance,**

**Respondent.**

**Case Number: C0247334**

**FINAL AGENCY DECISION**

It is the decision of the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA), Food and Nutrition Service (FNS), that there is sufficient evidence to support a finding that the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance (Retailer Operations), properly withdrew the authorization of Parker's Cate (Appellant), to participate as an authorized retail food store in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP).

**ISSUE**

The issue accepted for review is whether Retailer Operations acted consistent with 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1), in its administration of the SNAP when it withdrew the authorization of Appellant to participate as a SNAP retail food store.

**AUTHORITY**

7 U.S.C. § 2023, and the implementing regulations at 7 CFR § 279.1, provide that a food retailer aggrieved by administrative action under § 278.1, § 278.6, or § 278.7, may file a written request for review of the administrative action with FNS.

**CASE CHRONOLOGY**

FNS regulations require that stores be reauthorized on a set schedule. A handwritten SNAP reauthorization application dated March 8, 2021, was submitted. FNS-contracted personnel conducted an onsite store visit on March 11, 2021, to ascertain Appellant's continued eligibility to participate in the SNAP. Retailer Operations requested more information by letter dated April 20, 2021, to demonstrate Appellant's eligibility under Criterion A. The store was requested to provide invoices/receipts to verify that the store carried at least three stocking units of three different varieties of foods in the Dairy Products (milk, cheese, butter, yogurt, etc.) staple food categories. The letter states that the invoices/receipts submitted must be dated no more than 21

calendar days prior to the date of the store visit and could not be dated on or after the date of the store visit. It further stated that no invoices/receipts dated after April 20, 2021, would be accepted.

By letter dated May 20, 2021, the authorization of Appellant to participate as a retail food store in the SNAP was withdrawn because the firm did not meet the eligibility criteria for stores as enunciated in the regulations at 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1). Retailer Operations' letter informed the owner that Appellant failed to meet Criterion A and Criterion B. Appellant's eligibility under the need for access provision was also reviewed. Retailer Operations found that Appellant did not to meet the established criteria.

By letter dated June 1, 2021, the owner requested administrative review. The review was granted by letter dated July 2, 2021. The operations manager provided additional information by email dated July 14, 2021.

### **STANDARD OF REVIEW**

In an appeal of an adverse action, the Appellant bears the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence that the administrative action should be reversed. That means the Appellant has the burden of providing credible, relevant evidence that a reasonable mind, considering the record, would accept as sufficient to support a conclusion that the argument asserted is more likely to be true than not true.

### **CONTROLLING LAW AND REGULATIONS**

The controlling statute in this matter is contained in Section 14(a)(5) of the Food and Nutrition Act of 2008, as amended, and 7 U.S.C. § 2018. The SNAP regulations at 7 CFR Part 279 have been promulgated pursuant to the Food and Nutrition Act of 2008.

7 CFR § 271.2 states that Retail Food Store means: "An establishment that sells food for home preparation and consumption normally displayed in a public area, and either offers for sale, qualifying staple food items on a continuous basis, evidenced by having no fewer than seven different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety, including at least one variety of perishable foods in at least three such categories, (Criterion A) as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter, or has more than 50 percent of its total gross retail sales in staple foods (Criterion B) as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter as determined by visual inspection, marketing structure, business licenses, accessibility of food items offered for sale, purchase and sales records, counting of stockkeeping units, or other accounting recordkeeping methods that are customary or reasonable in the retail food industry as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter. Entities that have more than 50 percent of their total gross retail sales in: Food cooked or heated on-site by the retailer before or after purchase; and hot and/or cold prepared foods not intended for home preparation and consumption, including prepared foods that are consumed on the premises or sold for carry-out are not eligible for SNAP participation as retail food stores under 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter. Establishments that include separate businesses that operate under one roof and share the following commonalities: Ownership, sale of similar foods, and shared inventory, are a single firm when determining eligibility to participate in SNAP as retail food

stores.” 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(A) of the SNAP regulations as currently implemented define continuous basis as offering for sale no fewer than three different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety on any given day of operation.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(i) imparts program requirements for retail food store participation, which states: “(A) An establishment or house-to-house trade route shall normally be considered to have food business of a nature and extent that will effectuate the purposes of the program if it sells food for home preparation and consumption and meets one of the following criteria: Offer for sale, on a continuous basis, a variety of qualifying foods in each of the four categories of staple foods as defined in § 271.2 of this chapter, including perishable foods in at least three of the categories (Criterion A); or have more than 50 percent of the total gross retail sales of the establishment or route in staple foods (Criterion B).”

7 CFR § 271.2 states: “Staple food, means those food items intended for home preparation and consumption in each of the following four categories: Meat, poultry, or fish; bread or cereals; vegetables or fruits; and dairy products. Hot foods are not eligible for purchase with SNAP benefits and, therefore, do not qualify as staple foods for the purpose of determining eligibility under § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter.”

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii) provides that in order for a retail store to qualify for authorization under Criterion A, firms shall: “(A) Offer for sale and normally display in a public area, qualifying staple food items on a continuous basis, evidenced by having, on any given day of operation, no fewer than seven different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety and at least one variety of perishable foods in at least three staple food categories. Documentation to determine if a firm stocks enough required staple foods to offer them for sale on a continuous basis may be required in cases where it is not clear that the firm has made reasonable stocking efforts to meet the stocking requirement.” 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(A) of the SNAP regulations as currently implemented define continuous basis as offering for sale no fewer than three different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety on any given day of operation.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(iii) provides that for firms to qualify for authorization under Criterion B: “Firms must have more than 50 percent of their total gross retail sales in staple food sales. Total gross retail sales must include all retail sales of a firm, including food and non-food merchandise, as well as services, such as rental fees, professional fees, and entertainment, sports, games income. However, a fee directly connected to the processing of staple foods, such as raw meat, poultry, or fish by the service provider, may be calculated as staple food sales under Criterion B.”

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(6) regarding access states: “FNS will consider whether the applicant firm is located in an area with significantly limited access to food when the applicant firm fails to meet Criterion A per paragraph (b)(1)(ii) or Criterion B per paragraph (b)(1)(iii) of this section so long as the applicant firm meets all other SNAP authorization requirements.”

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(iv) states: “Ineligible firms: Firms that do not meet the eligibility requirements in this section or that do not effectuate the purpose of the SNAP shall not be eligible for program participation. New applicant firms that are found to be ineligible will be denied authorization and authorized firms will be withdrawn from program participation. Ineligible firms under this paragraph include, but are not limited to, stores selling only accessory foods, including spices, candy, soft drinks, tea, or coffee; ice cream vendors selling solely ice cream; and specialty doughnut shops or bakeries not selling bread. In addition, firms that are considered to be restaurants, that is, firms that have more than 50 percent of their total gross sales in foods cooked or heated on-site by the retailer before or after purchase; and hot and/or cold prepared foods not intended for home preparation or consumption, including prepared foods that are consumed on the premises or sold for carryout, shall not qualify for participation as retail food stores under Criterion A or B. This includes firms that primarily sell prepared foods that are consumed on the premises or sold for carryout.”

7 CFR § 278.1(l)(1) Withdrawing authorization reads: “FNS shall withdraw the authorization of any firm authorized to participate in the program for any of the following reasons. (i) The firm’s continued participation in the program will not further the purposes of the program; (ii) The firm fails to meet the specifications of paragraph (b), (c), (d), (e), (f), (g), (h), or (i) of this section; (iii) The firm fails to meet the requirements for eligibility under Criterion A or B, as specified in paragraph (b)(1)(i) of this section; or, for co-located wholesale/retail firms, the firm fails to meet the requirements of paragraph (b)(1)(vi) of this section, for the time period specified in paragraph (k)(2) of this section.”

7 CFR § 278.1(k)(2) requires that firms withdrawn for failure to meet program eligibility criteria “shall not be eligible to submit a new application for authorization in the program for a minimum period of six months” from the effective date of the withdrawal.

### **APPELLANT’S CONTENTIONS**

All contentions as presented and submissions, have been considered in making this decision, whether listed or not.

- I wish to point out that we have been honorable participants for 10 years now. It was always our intention to be a faithful Criteria an Operator.
- We understand the need for the program and its restrictions and have been very good partners with SNAP over the years. We have been respectful to abide by the program rules and restrictions to not allow our customers to purchase non-authorized staple foods. We have been diligent to maintain the products that SNAP requires of its convenience store operators.
- As a retail business, we struggled to sell yogurt and butter, as do most convenience stores so we brought in what we thought was an acceptable replacement which was a frozen yogurt. We now understand that item is considered an accessory. Once we realized the error, we immediately ordered into our store’s yogurt and butter.
- Once we discussed that aspect and realized the error, we immediately ordered into our store’s yogurt and butter. In summary we failed to carry one stocking unit for one of the three varieties of foods in one of the staple food’s groups, the Dairy.
- We were missing either a yogurt, a butter, or an additional non-cow’s milk product. From your own audit it has shown that we met all other criteria.

- We have since reordered the yogurt and/or butter to all our stores to be in complete compliance with all SNAP restrictions and stipulations.
- The attachment will show proof of our ordering to address this. We feel that the decision to reject our application for renewal will cause undue hardship for our customers who benefit from the program and our participation.
- We feel that the de-authorization is extreme for one missing item, and we ask that you reconsider your decision.
- We appreciate the opportunity to include additional information in defense of our case. Attached are summaries of purchases our stores have made of the items that we neglected to carry due to our misinterpretation of the standard. These purchases are intended to reflect our continued support of and compliance with SNAP requirements.

### **ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS**

This review is to validate or to invalidate the determination by Retailer Operations; as such it is limited to consideration of the relevant facts at the time of the decision. The authorization of a store to participate in the SNAP must be in accord with the Act and the regulations, as amended; those requirements of law cannot be waived. The onsite review of Appellant's food inventory revealed insufficient varieties and stocking units in the dairy product's staple foods category. The SNAP regulations at Section 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(A) under Criterion A, as currently implemented, require a firm shall offer for sale and normally display in a public area, no fewer than three different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety on any given day of operation, and at least one variety of perishable foods in at least three staple food categories. The evidence supports that Appellant did not meet Criterion A.

The operations manager submitted a Velocity Report for Appellant for 05/02/2021 - 07/13/2021. dated July 14, 2021. This report shows that blueberry and strawberry yogurt and stick margarine were procured for the location. Upon review, the report is not adequate to demonstrate that Appellant met the eligibility requirements in the dairy staple foods category at the time the determination was rendered. As the owner properly noted, the store was missing either a yogurt, a butter, or an additional non-cow's milk product, at the time of the determination. As such, it did not meet Criterion A. That Appellant may now meet Criterion A, is not the subject of this review.

Based on Appellant's own reauthorization application, Retailer Operations determined that Appellant was also ineligible for authorization under Criterion B per 7 CFR § 278.1 (b)(1)(iii). The owner estimated the firm's retail sales from staple foods was 4% of total retail sales. The owner provided no evidence to support that Appellant met Criterion B at the time of the withdrawal. Retailer Operations also properly reviewed the firm for need for access as per the regulations at 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(6) and found it did not qualify.

SNAP authorization is dependent solely upon whether a firm meets the eligibility requirements for participation at the time of reauthorization. The preponderance of evidence supports that Appellant did not meet the regulatory requirements of Criterion A or Criterion B at the time the withdrawal decision was made. SNAP authorization is an administrative privilege granted upon evidence of eligibility and continued compliance with the governing laws and regulations. If a

firm does not conform to the applicable statutes and regulations, the same provide for the firm's removal from the SNAP.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on a review of the evidence, the determination by Retailer Operations to withdraw the authorization of Appellant to participate as a SNAP retailer is sustained. The firm did not meet the requirements of a retail food store as set forth in Section 278.1(b)(1) of the SNAP regulations when it was withdrawn. In accordance with 7 CFR § 278.1(k)(2), the owners will not be eligible to reapply for participation as a retail food store in the SNAP for a minimum period of six months from the effective date of the withdrawal. This decision will take effect thirty (30) days after the date of delivery to the firm.

General questions regarding the SNAP application process can be handled by contacting 877-823-4369, and by consulting the USDA website.

### **RIGHTS AND REMEDIES**

Your attention is called to Section 14 of the Food and Nutrition Act of 2008, and to the regulations at 7 CFR § 279.7 with respect to the applicable right to judicial review of this decision. Please note that if a judicial review is desired, the Complaint, naming the United States as the defendant, must be filed in the U.S. District Court for the district in which Appellant's owners reside or are engaged in business, or in any court of record of the State having competent jurisdiction.

If any Complaint is filed, it must be filed within thirty (30) days of delivery of this Decision. Under the Freedom of Information Act, we are releasing this information in a redacted format as appropriate. FNS will protect, to the extent provided by law, personal information that could constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy.

M. Viens  
ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OFFICER

August 3, 2021