

**U.S. Department of Agriculture
Food and Nutrition Service
Administrative Review Branch**

Robles Corner Mart,

Appellant,

v.

**Office of Retailer Operations and
Compliance,**

Respondent.

Case Number: C0258090

FINAL AGENCY DECISION

The U.S. Department of Agriculture, Food and Nutrition Service (FNS), finds that there is insufficient evidence to support the determination by the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance to deny the application of Robles Corner Mart (hereinafter Appellant) to participate as a retail food store in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP). Therefore, the determination is reversed.

ISSUE

The issue accepted for review is whether the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance took appropriate action, consistent with Title 7 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 278, when it denied the application of Appellant to participate as a SNAP retail store.

AUTHORITY

According to 7 U.S.C. § 2023 and the implementing regulations at 7 CFR § 279.1, “A food retailer or wholesale food concern aggrieved by administrative action under § 278.1, § 278.6 or § 278.7 may file a written request for review of the administrative action with FNS.”

CASE CHRONOLOGY

The record shows that Appellant applied to participate as a SNAP retailer food store on August 9, 2022. According to the firm’s application, the store opened for business on August 1, 2022. On August 28, 2022, the Appellant firm was visited by an FNS contractor in an effort to determine whether or not the firm met eligibility requirements to be reauthorized in SNAP. During this visit, the contractor took photographs of the store and its inventory, spoke with store personnel, and completed a written report detailing its observations.

After reviewing Appellant's application and evaluating the store visit report and photos, the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance determined that the firm did not carry a sufficient quantity or variety of staple foods to be eligible for SNAP participation under Criterion A or Criterion B. This determination was made in accordance with SNAP regulations at 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1). According to the contractor's written record, the firm had insufficient inventory in the dairy staple food category making it ineligible under Criterion A. Additionally, both the application and the store visit report indicate that the firm was not eligible under Criterion B.

In a letter dated September 2, 2022, the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance informed Appellant that its application to participate as an authorized retailer in SNAP was being denied because it did not offer for sale a variety of foods in sufficient quantities on a continuous basis and was found to carry too few items in the four staple food categories. The letter also informed Appellant that it did not have more than 50 percent of its total gross retail sales in staple food sales as required for authorization under Criterion B. Additionally, the letter stated that FNS considered the firm's eligibility under the Need for Access provision of the regulations found at 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(6), but determined that the Appellant does not qualify for SNAP under this provision.

As a result of being found ineligible for participation under both Criteria A and B, and being found ineligible under the Need for Access provision, Appellant's SNAP application was denied for a period of six months pursuant to regulation at 7 CFR § 278.1(k)(2).

In a request sent via email on September 8, 2022, Appellant appealed the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance's decision and requested an administrative review of this determination. The appeal was granted. No subsequent correspondence was received from Appellant.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

In appeals of adverse actions, Appellant bears the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence, that the administrative action should be reversed. That means Appellant has the burden of providing relevant evidence which a reasonable mind, considering the record as a whole, would accept as sufficient to support a conclusion that the matter asserted is more likely to be true than not true.

CONTROLLING LAW

The controlling statute in this matter is contained in the Food and Nutrition Act of 2008, as amended, 7 USC § 2018 and § 278 of Title 7 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). In particular, 7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1) establishes the authority upon which FNS shall deny the application of any firm which fails to meet established eligibility requirements.

7 CFR § 271.2 defines a Retail Food Store as: An establishment that sells food for home preparation and consumption normally displayed in a public area, and either offers for sale, qualifying staple food items on a continuous basis, evidenced by having no fewer than seven

different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety, including at least one variety of perishable foods in at least three such categories, (Criterion A) as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter, or has more than 50 percent of its total gross retail sales in staple foods (Criterion B) as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter as determined by visual inspection, marketing structure, business licenses, accessibility of food items offered for sale, purchase and sales records, counting of stockkeeping units, or other accounting recordkeeping methods that are customary or reasonable in the retail food industry as set forth in § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter. Entities that have more than 50 percent of their total gross retail sales in: Food cooked or heated on-site by the retailer before or after purchase; and hot and/or cold prepared foods not intended for home preparation and consumption, including prepared foods that are consumed on the premises or sold for carry-out are not eligible for SNAP participation as retail food stores under § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter. Establishments that include separate businesses that operate under one roof and share the following commonalities: Ownership, sale of similar foods, and shared inventory, are considered to be a single firm when determining eligibility to participate in SNAP as retail food stores.

7 CFR § 271.2 defines staple food as: Those food items intended for home preparation and consumption in each of the following four categories: Meat, poultry, or fish; bread or cereals; vegetables or fruits; and dairy products. Hot foods are not eligible for purchase with SNAP benefits and, therefore, do not qualify as staple foods for the purpose of determining eligibility under § 278.1(b)(1) of this chapter. Commercially processed foods and prepared mixtures with multiple ingredients that do not represent a single staple food category shall only be counted in one staple food category. For example, foods such as cold pizza, macaroni and cheese, multi-ingredient soup, or frozen dinners, shall only be counted as one staple food item and will be included in the staple food category of the main ingredient as determined by FNS. Accessory food items include foods that are generally considered snack foods or desserts such as, but not limited to, chips, ice cream, crackers, cupcakes, cookies, popcorn, pastries, and candy, and other food items that complement or supplement meals, such as, but not limited to, coffee, tea, cocoa, carbonated and uncarbonated drinks, condiments, spices, salt, and sugar. Items shall not be classified as accessory food exclusively based on packaging size but rather based on the aforementioned definition and as determined by FNS. A food product containing an accessory food item as its main ingredient shall be considered an accessory food item. Accessory food items shall not be considered staple foods for purposes of determining the eligibility of any firm.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(i) states: An establishment or house-to-house trade route shall normally be considered to have food business of a nature and extent that will effectuate the purposes of the program if it sells food for home preparation and consumption and meets one of the following criteria: Offer for sale, on a continuous basis, a variety of qualifying foods in each of the four categories of staple foods as defined in § 271.2 of this chapter, including perishable foods in at least three of the categories (Criterion A); or have more than 50 percent of the total gross retail sales of the establishment or route in staple foods (Criterion B).

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii) provides that for a retail store to qualify for authorization under Criterion A, a firm shall: Offer for sale and normally display in a public area, qualifying staple food items on a continuous basis, evidenced by having, on any given day of operation, no fewer than seven

different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety and at least one variety of perishable foods in at least three staple food categories. Documentation to determine if a firm stocks a sufficient amount of required staple foods to offer them for sale on a continuous basis may be required in cases where it is not clear that the firm has made reasonable stocking efforts to meet the stocking requirement. Such documentation can be achieved through verifying information, when requested by FNS, such as invoices and receipts in order to prove that the firm had ordered and/or received a sufficient amount of required staple foods up to 21 calendar days prior to the date of the store visit. Failure to provide verifying information related to stock when requested may result in denial or withdrawal of authorization. Failure to cooperate with store visits shall result in the denial or withdrawal of authorization.

NOTE: Full implementation of the definition of variety and stocking requirements cited above was delayed by the Consolidated Appropriations Act of 2017. Therefore, the three paragraphs below reflect the definition and stocking requirements as currently implemented.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(A) as currently implemented defines continuous basis under Criterion A as offering for sale no fewer than three different varieties of food items in each of the four staple food categories with a minimum depth of stock of three stocking units for each qualifying staple variety on any given day of operation.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(B) as currently implemented: Offer for sale perishable staple food items in at least two staple food categories. Perishable foods are items which are either frozen staple food items or fresh, unrefrigerated, or refrigerated staple food items that will spoil or suffer significant deterioration in quality within 2-3 weeks.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(ii)(C) as currently implemented: Offer a variety of staple foods which means different types of foods, such as apples, cabbage, tomatoes, and squash in the fruit or vegetable staple food category, or milk, cheese, butter and yogurt in the dairy category. Variety of foods is not to be interpreted as different brands, different nutrient values, different varieties of packaging, or different package sizes. Similar processed food items with varying ingredients such as, but not limited to, sausages, breakfast cereals, milk, sliced breads, and cheeses, and similar unprocessed food items, such as, but not limited to different varieties of apples, cabbage, tomatoes, or squash shall not each be considered as more than one staple food variety for the purpose of determining variety. Multiple ingredient food items...such as...cold pizza, macaroni and cheese, soup, or frozen dinners, shall only be counted as one staple food variety each and will normally be included in the staple food category of the main ingredient as determined by the FNS.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(1)(iii) provides that for firms to qualify for authorization under Criterion B: “Firms must have more than 50 percent of their total gross retail sales in staple food sales. Total gross retail sales must include all retail sales of a firm, including food and non-food merchandise, as well as services, such as rental fees, professional fees, and entertainment/sports/games income.

7 CFR § 278.1(b)(6) deals with the need for access: “FNS will consider whether the applicant firm is located in an area with significantly limited access to food when the applicant firm fails to meet Criterion A per paragraph (b)(1)(ii) or Criterion B per paragraph (b)(1)(iii) of this section so long as the applicant firm meets all other SNAP authorization requirements.”

7 CFR § 278.1(k)(2) states in part: “FNS shall deny the application of any firm if it determines that the firm has failed to meet the eligibility requirements for authorization under Criterion A or Criterion B, as specified in paragraph (b)(1)(i) of this section. Any firm that has been denied authorization on these bases shall not be eligible to submit a new application for authorization in the program for a minimum period of six months from the effective date of the denial.”

APPELLANT’S CONTENTIONS

The following may represent a summary of Appellant’s contentions in this matter; however, in reaching a decision, full attention and consideration has been given to all contentions presented, including any not specifically recapitulated or specifically referenced herein:

- The owner authorized the store’s bookkeeper to represent the firm in the administrative review proceedings; and,
- Submitted documentation of store inventory.

Appellant submitted five invoices for inventory purchases in support of these contentions.

ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

A review of the evidence does not support the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance’s determination in this case. Accordingly, it is unnecessary to address Appellant’s contentions in this matter.

This administrative review decision is based on the specific circumstances of this case as documented by materials provided by Appellant and the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance. In addition, this administrative review decision does not establish policy or supersede federal law or regulations.

CONCLUSION

After a review of the pertinent documentation, and based on the discussion above, the initial decision by Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance to deny the application of Appellant to participate as a retailer in SNAP is reversed. The Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance should continue to process the Appellant’s SNAP retailer application to determine eligibility. This decision does not preclude the Office of Retailer Operations and Compliance from asking for additional documentation to assess if the firm currently meets the regulatory criteria to participate in the SNAP.

Under the Freedom of Information Act, FNS is releasing this information in a redacted format as appropriate. FNS will protect, to the extent provided by law, personal information that could constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy.

ROBERT T. DEEGAN
ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OFFICER

September 16, 2022